

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

-----X

IN RE TERRORIST ATTACKS ON SEPTEMBER 11, 2001 :

:
: **PARTIAL ORDER**
: **AND JUDGMENT**
:
:
: 1:03 MDL 1570 (GBD) (SN)

-----X

This Document Relates to

Hoglan v. Iran

1:11-cv-07550 (GBD) (SN)

In accordance with the Reports and Recommendations of Magistrate Judge Sarah

Netburn issued October 12, 2016, and October 14, 2016, it is HEREBY:

ORDERED that Partial Final Judgment is entered in favor of the 13 Estates and 203

individual family members listed herein and against all Sovereign Defendants;

ORDERED that Plaintiffs listed herein are awarded: (1) economic damages in the amount of \$469,465,035, as set forth below; (2) damages for pain and suffering of \$2,000,000 per Decedent for a total of \$26,000,000, as set forth below; (3) damages for solatium totaling \$1,346,125,000, as set forth below; and, (4) prejudgment interest on the amount of \$1,372,125,000, in pain and suffering and solatium damages since September 11, 2001, to the date of judgment at the rate of 4.96 percent per annum, compounded annually;

ORDERED that Defendants are jointly and severally liable for the entire award;

ORDERED that Plaintiffs' request for punitive damages is DENIED WITHOUT PREJUDICE to Plaintiffs' ability to file a future application for punitive damages.

AND IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the economic damages and non-economic damages awarded to the Decedents' Estates are as follows:

DECEDENT	ECONOMIC LOSS	PAIN & SUFFERING	TOTAL AWARD
Estate of Siew Nya Ang	\$7,407,342	\$2,000,000	\$9,407,342
Estate of Mark Kendall Bingham	\$7,617,663	\$2,000,000	\$9,617,663
Estate of Joyce Ann Carpeneto	\$1,926,378	\$2,000,000	\$3,926,378
Estate of Wayne T. Davis	\$9,388,123	\$2,000,000	\$11,388,123
Estate of Timmy Grazioso	\$307,289,003	\$2,000,000	\$309,289,003
Estate of LeRoy W. Homer, Jr.	\$9,281,150	\$2,000,000	\$11,281,150
Estate of Hweidar Jian	\$10,108,875	\$2,000,000	\$12,108,875
Estate of Leon Lebor	\$747,568	\$2,000,000	\$2,747,568
Estate of Christopher E. Lunder	\$34,961,894	\$2,000,000	\$36,961,894
Estate of Joseph D. Mistrulli	\$4,999,143	\$2,000,000	\$6,999,143
Estate of Louis Nacke	\$8,185,357	\$2,000,000	\$10,185,357
Estate of Sandra Wright-Cartledge	\$1,132,626	\$2,000,000	\$3,132,626
Estate of Marc Scott Zeplin	\$66,419,913	\$2,000,000	\$68,419,913
TOTAL	\$469,465,035	\$26,000,000	\$495,465,035

AND IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that damages for solatium for the individual Plaintiffs

are awarded as follows:

DECEDENT	PLAINTIFF	RELATIONSHIP	SOLATIUM
Mark Kendall Bingham	Alice Hoglan a/k/a Hoagland	Parent	\$12,500,000
Siew Nya Ang	Kui Liang Lee	Spouse	\$12,500,000
Siew Nya Ang	Winnee Lee	Child	\$8,500,000
Siew Nya Ang	Jeanee Lee	Child	\$8,500,000
Michael Bane	Arline Peabody-Bane	Step-Parent	\$4,250,000
Michael Bane	Brian Major	Step-Sibling	\$2,125,000
Michael Bane	Brenda E. Jobe	Step-Sibling	\$2,125,000
Joyce Ann Carpento	Joseph Carpento	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Sandra Wright Cartledge	Dian Dembinski	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Sandra Wright Cartledge	Loretta Haines	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Sandra Wright Cartledge	Stephen Bradish	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Sandra Wright Cartledge	Jack Bradish	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Sandra Wright Cartledge	Geraldine Deborah Spaeter	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Peter Chirchirillo	Nicholas Chirchirillo	Child	\$8,500,000
Peter Chirchirillo	Michael Chirchirillo	Child	\$8,500,000
Jeffrey Coale	JoanAnn Coale	Parent	\$8,500,000
Jeffrey Coale	Leslie Coale Brown	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Daniel M. Coffey	Jeanette Coffey	Parent	\$8,500,000
Daniel M. Coffey	Estate of Daniel F. Coffey, Jr.	Parent	\$8,500,000
Jason Coffey	Colleen McDonald	Fiancee	\$12,500,000

Jeffrey Collman	Keith Bradkowski	Spouse	\$12,500,000
Jeffrey Collman	Estate of Beverly Sutton	Parent	\$8,500,000
Jeffrey Collman	Kathryn Collman	Step-Parent	\$4,250,000
Jeffrey Collman	Carolyn Sutton	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Jeffrey Collman	Vicki Lynn Michel	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Jeffrey Collman	Charles Gengler	Step-Sibling	\$2,125,000
Jeffrey Collman	Steven Gengler	Step-Sibling	\$2,125,000
Jeffrey Collman	Susan Bohan	Step-Sibling	\$2,125,000
Wayne T. Davis	Tanya Davis	Spouse	\$12,500,000
Wayne T. Davis	Gabrielle Hunter Davis	Child	\$8,500,000
Wayne T. Davis	Malachai Roarke Davis	Child	\$8,500,000
Wayne T. Davis	Noverta Davis-Dean	Parent	\$8,500,000
Michael Diehl	Jason Diehl	Child	\$8,500,000
Michael Diehl	Jeannette Diehl	Child	\$8,500,000
Judy Fernandez	Emma Fernandez Regan	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Judy Fernandez	Cirilo Fernandez	Parent	\$8,500,000
Judy Fernandez	Richard Fernandez	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Ronald Gamboa	Renee L. Gamboa	Parent	\$8,500,000
Ronald Gamboa	Estate of Ranulf Gamboa	Parent	\$8,500,000
Ronald Gamboa	Maria Joule	Sister	\$4,250,000
Ronald Gamboa	Rachel G. Malubay	Sister	\$4,250,000
William Godshalk	Aleese Hartmann	Fiancee	\$12,500,000
William Godshalk	James Bond Godshalk	Parent	\$8,500,000
William Godshalk	Jane G. Haller	Sibling	\$4,250,000
John Grazioso	Kathryn Grazioso	Child	\$8,500,000
John Grazioso	Kristen Grazioso	Child	\$8,500,000
John Grazioso	Michael Grazioso	Child	\$8,500,000
John Grazioso	Sandra Grazioso	Parent	\$8,500,000
John Grazioso	Carolee Azzarello	Sibling	\$4,250,000
John Grazioso	Karen Ventre	Sibling	\$4,250,000
John Grazioso	Krysty Grazioso	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Timmy Grazioso	Deborah Grazioso	Spouse	\$12,500,000
Timmy Grazioso	Sandra Grazioso	Parent	\$8,500,000
Timmy Grazioso	Carolee Azzarello	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Timmy Grazioso	Lauren Grazioso	Child	\$8,500,000
Timmy Grazioso	Briana Grazioso	Child	\$8,500,000
Timmy Grazioso	Karen Ventre	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Timmy Grazioso	Krysty Grazioso	Sibling	\$4,250,000
James Halvorson	Douglas Halvorson	Child	\$8,500,000
James Halvorson	Evelyn Halvorson	Parent	\$8,500,000
James Halvorson	Kate Halvorson	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Donald G. Havlish	Michaela Havlish	Child	\$8,500,000
Donald G. Havlish	Lea Michaela Bitterman	Step-Child	\$8,500,000

Donald G. Havlish	Sean Bitterman	Step-Child	\$8,500,000
James Jeffery Hobin	Derrick Hobin	Child	\$8,500,000
LeRoy W. Homer, Jr.	Melodie Homer	Spouse	\$12,500,000
LeRoy W. Homer, Jr.	Laurel Homer	Child	\$8,500,000
Hweidar Jian	Ju-Hsiu Jian	Spouse	\$12,500,000
Hweidar Jian	William Jian	Child	\$8,500,000
Hweidar Jian	Kevin Jian	Child	\$8,500,000
Donald W. Jones	Audrey R. Jones	Parent	\$8,500,000
Donald W. Jones	John R. Jones	Parent	\$8,500,000
Donald W. Jones	Robert A. Jones	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Donald W. Jones	Candy Moyer	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Jeanette LaFond-Menchino	Anita Korsonsky	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Jeanette LaFond-Menchino	Dina LaFond	Parent	\$8,500,000
Denis Lavelle	Emily Lavelle	Parent	\$8,500,000
Denis Lavelle	Patricia Caloia	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Denis Lavelle	Barbara Dziadek	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Denis Lavelle	Kathleen Palacio	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Denis Lavelle	Paul Lavelle	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Leon Lebor	Bessie Lebor	Parent	\$8,500,000
Leon Lebor	Barbara Lurman	Child	\$8,500,000
Leon Lebor	Joy a.k.a Rina Kaufman	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Robert Levine	Stephanie Giglio	Child	\$8,500,000
Catherine Lisa LoGuidice	Estate of Carmello J. LoGuidice	Parent	\$8,500,000
Joseph Lostrangio	Joseph Lostrangio, Jr.	Child	\$4,250,000
Joseph Lostrangio	Cathryn Lostrangio	Child	\$4,250,000
Joseph Lostrangio	James Lostrangio	Parent	\$8,500,000
Christopher E. Lunder	Karen Lunder	Spouse	\$12,500,000
Noell Maerz	Erich Maerz	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Mary Melendez	Ramon Melendez	Child	\$8,500,000
Mary Melendez	Ricky Melendez	Child	\$8,500,000
Mary Melendez	Jesse Melendez	Child	\$8,500,000
Mary Melendez	Tyler Melendez	Child	\$8,500,000
Mary Melendez	Florence Rosario	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Mary Melendez	Margaret Montanez	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Peter T. Milano	Peter C. Milano	Child	\$8,500,000
Peter T. Milano	Jessica Milano	Child	\$8,500,000
Peter T. Milano	Alfred Milano	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Peter T. Milano	Frank Milano	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Peter T. Milano	Maureen Racioppi	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Peter T. Milano	Thomas Milano	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Joesph D. Mistrulli	Philomena Mistrulli	Spouse	\$12,500,000
Joesph D. Mistrulli	MaryAnn Mistrulli	Child	\$8,500,000

Joseph D. Mistrulli	Joseph Mistrulli	Child	\$8,500,000
Joseph D. Mistrulli	Angela Mistrulli Cantone	Child	\$8,500,000
Joseph D. Mistrulli	Ann Mistrulli	Parent	\$8,500,000
Joseph D. Mistrulli	Maria Lambert	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Joseph D. Mistrulli	Johnny Mistrulli	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Yvette Moreno	Rolando Ruben Moreno	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Yvette Moreno	Leiana Moreno	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Yvette Moreno	Noelia Moreno	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Louis Nacke	Amy Martinez	Spouse	\$12,500,000
Brian Nunez	Eric Nunez	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Brian Nunez	Neal Green	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Salvatore T. Papasso	Theresa Papasso	Parent	\$8,500,000
Salvatore T. Papasso	Salvatore Papasso	Parent	\$8,500,000
Salvatore T. Papasso	Vincent Papasso	Sibling	\$4,250,000
John Perry	James Perry	Parent	\$8,500,000
John Perry	Joel R. Perry	Sibling	\$4,250,000
John Perry	Janice Perry	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Marsha Ratchford	Claudia Stallworth	Parent	\$8,500,000
Marsha Ratchford	Reginald Simpson	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Marsha Ratchford	Roosevelt Stallworth	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Marsha Ratchford	Carl Stallworth	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Marsha Ratchford	Cynthia Watts	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Marsha Ratchford	Angela Stallworth-Blunt	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Marsha Ratchford	Brian Christian	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Marsha Ratchford	Amanda Rogers	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Joshua Reiss	Gary Reiss	Parent	\$8,500,000
Joshua Reiss	Adam Reiss	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Joshua Reiss	Jordan Reiss	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Joshua Reiss	Jonathan Reiss	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Joshua Reiss	Jennifer Reiss	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Elvin Romero	Estate of Carmen Romero	Parent	\$8,500,000
Elvin Romero	Issac Romero	Parent	\$8,500,000
Elvin Romero	Diana Diaz	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Richard Rosenthal	Estate of Evan Rosenthal	Child	\$8,500,000
Richard Rosenthal	Seth Rosenthal	Child	\$8,500,000
Richard Rosenthal	Leonard Rosenthal	Parent	\$8,500,000
Richard Rosenthal	Florence Rosenthal	Parent	\$8,500,000
Richard Rosenthal	Audrey Model	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Maria Theresa Santillan	Victor Santillan	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Maria Theresa Santillan	Raymond Santillan	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Victor Saracini	Kirsten Saracini	Child	\$8,500,000
Victor Saracini	Brielle Saracini	Child	\$8,500,000
Scott Schertzer	Lori Brody	Sibling	\$4,250,000

Scott Schertzer	Ellen Schertzer	Parent	\$8,500,000
Hagay Shefi	Roy-Yetkutiel Shefi	Child	\$8,500,000
Hagay Shefi	Naomi-Ruth Shefi	Child	\$8,500,000
Paul K. Sloan	Patricia Sloan	Parent	\$8,500,000
Paul K. Sloan	Matt Sloan	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Paul K. Sloan	Sarah Funk	Sibling	\$4,250,000
George Smith	Estate of Marion Thomas	Grandparent	\$8,500,000
George Smith	Raymond Smith, Jr.	Sibling	\$4,250,000
George Smith	Carl Smith	Sibling	\$4,250,000
George Smith	Kevin Smith	Sibling	\$4,250,000
George Smith	Korry Smith	Sibling	\$4,250,000
George Smith	Tanya Warren	Sibling	\$4,250,000
George Smith	Latricia Smith	Sibling	\$4,250,000
George Smith	Elaine Smith	Sibling	\$4,250,000
George Smith	Christine Jackson	Sibling	\$4,250,000
George Smith	Barbara Hargrove	Sibling	\$4,250,000
George Smith	Estate of Deborah Sallad	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Timothy Soulas	Timothy P. Soulas, Jr.	Child	\$8,500,000
Timothy Soulas	Andrew J. Soulas	Child	\$8,500,000
Timothy Soulas	Christopher Soulas	Child	\$8,500,000
Timothy Soulas	Matthew Soulas	Child	\$8,500,000
Timothy Soulas	Nicole Soulas	Child	\$8,500,000
Timothy Soulas	Daniel Soulas	Child	\$8,500,000
Timothy Soulas	Frederick Soulas	Parent	\$8,500,000
Timothy Soulas	Stephen Soulas	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Timothy Soulas	Frederick Soulas III	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Timothy Soulas	Dan Soulas	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Timothy Soulas	Michelle Donlan	Sibling	\$4,250,000
William Steiner	Darren Steiner	Child	\$8,500,000
William Steiner	Jordan Steiner	Child	\$8,500,000
William Steiner	Meridith Reverdito	Child	\$8,500,000
William Steiner	Estate of William Steiner	Parent	\$8,500,000
William Steiner	Robert Steiner	Sibling	\$4,250,000
William Steiner	George Steiner	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Andrew Stergiopoulos	Kathleen Stergiopoulos	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Andrew Stergiopoulos	George Stergiopoulos, Jr.	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Edward W. Straub	Aaron Straub	Child	\$8,500,000
Edward W. Straub	Jonathan Straub	Child	\$8,500,000
Edward W. Straub	Michael Straub	Child	\$8,500,000
Edward W. Straub	Samuel Straub	Child	\$8,500,000
Edward W. Straub	Edward Straub	Parent	\$8,500,000
Edward W. Straub	Stanley Straub	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Edward W. Straub	Matthew Straub	Sibling	\$4,250,000

Jennifer Tino	Salvatore Tino	Parent	\$8,500,000
Jennifer Tino	Jeffrey Tino	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Jennifer Tino	Salvatore Tino, Jr.	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Jeanmarie Wallendorf	Joseph Nicklo	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Jeanmarie Wallendorf	Mellanie Chafe	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Jeanmarie Wallendorf	Christopher Barton	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Jeanmarie Wallendorf	John Barton, a minor	Parent	\$8,500,000
Timothy Ward	Susanne Ward-Baker	Parent	\$8,500,000
William Wilson	Jeanne McDermott	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Marc Scott Zeplin	Deborah Zeplin	Spouse	\$12,500,000
Marc Scott Zeplin	Ryan Zeplin	Child	\$8,500,000
Marc Scott Zeplin	Ethan Zeplin	Child	\$8,500,000
TOTAL			\$1,346,125,000

IT IS FURTHERMORE:

ORDERED that Plaintiffs shall forthwith serve a copy of this Partial Order and Judgment upon Defendants.

This is a final, appealable order. See Fed.R.App.P.(4)(a).

SO ORDERED.

DATE _____

GEORGE B. DANIELS
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE